

**OPINION**

From Prof. Dr. Ivan Dimitrov Penov; Agricultural University Plovdiv; 3.8. Economics and management on the scientific papers for participation in a competition for the academic position of "Professor"; professional field "3.8. Economics (business marketing and business management)", announced in State Gasete N 41 / 18.05.2021, with candidate Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ivan Yovchev Boevsky.  
Order №3-ПК-193 / 24.06.2021 of the Rector of NBU, and Decision of the AC №10 / 22.06.2021

**I. Assessment of compliance with the minimum national requirements and the requirements of the New Bulgarian University**

	Описание	Requirement	Reported
A	Dissertation work	50	50
B	Habilitation thesis - Monograph	100	100
Г	Articles and reports, chapters in a monograph	200	263,1
Д	Citations or reviews in scientific journals	100	180
E	Management of doctoral students, participation and project management	100	365
Ж	Research program; Membership in organizations, participation in management: curricula; Organization of conferences, etc.	70	95
З	Student satisfaction; Graduates; Internships; Foreign language courses; etc.	70	80
И	Academic duties; Discipline; etc	70	125
<b>TOTAL</b>		<b>760</b>	<b>1258,1</b>

The materials presented by the candidate Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ivan Yovchev Boevsky correspond to the national minimum requirements and the requirements of the New Bulgarian University. For the indicators from groups Г,Д,Е they are above the minimum national requirements. Regarding the indicators mandatory for NBU (E,Ж, З), the candidate reports 300 points, while the requirement is 210 points. The materials provided by the candidate prove that the quantitative requirements of Law on the evaluation of the academic staff in the Republic of Bulgaria and of the New Bulgarian University for holding the academic position "Professor" have been met.

**II. Research (creative) activity and results**

1. Evaluation of the monographic work, creative performances, or other publications, corresponding in volume and integrity of the monographic work, including evaluation of the scientific and scientific-applied contributions of the author.

The monographic work "Cooperatives in Bulgaria - Specific organizational design, marketing management, governance structure, and innovation" has 319 pages. It consists of an introduction, 2 parts and a discussion and summary.

The introduction is 19 pages long and formulates research questions and hypotheses. The first part - "Theories of cooperative development and its attributes" is 72 pages long and it discusses the various definitions of cooperatives and the basic models of cooperative behavior. The second part - "Cooperatives



in Bulgaria" is 171 pages long, and it analyzes the development of cooperatives in different periods: before 1944; 1944-1989; and after 1990. The discussion and summaries are 25 pages long. The monography is very well structured and gives a clear idea of the theory related to cooperatives and the development of the cooperative movement in Bulgaria.

I do not know anyone who has published such a comprehensive work on the problem in recent years. Assoc. Prof. Boevsky is one of the few researchers working in the field of cooperative behavior. This topic is neglected in our country, although the explanation and the factors giving rise to collective action are still a challenge for economic theory.

2. Evaluation of the contributions in the other attached publications (creative performances), made after the appointment of the academic position "Chief Assistant" or the academic position "Associate Professor" (for the candidates for professor). It also includes an assessment of the requirement for peer-reviewed publications.

In Group Γ, 26 publications are presented: 2 have been published in journals referenced in world databases; 16 are articles published in magazines with scientific review; 2 are studies with scientific review; 6 are chapters from collective monographs. Sixteen of the publications are in Bulgarian; 6 are in English; 4 in German. The following areas of research can be outlined in the candidate's publications.

The first is related to the study of customer relations, customer loyalty programs, management, marketing [(indicator 7): 1,2,4,6,10,11; (indicator 10): 4,5]. Here, along with the generally accepted challenges related to this topic, such as classic and modern business strategies, good practices; reasons for implementing a specific strategy; factors for success of a given strategy, Assoc. Prof. Boevsky also considers the problems related to the formation of alliances, building and functioning of networks, stimulating collective action, etc.

The second area is related to the development of cooperatives [(indicator 7): 2; (indicator 8): 7.16 (indicator 9): 1; (indicator 10): 2,3,6]. Assoc. Prof. Boevsky is one of the few researchers working on this issue. Cooperative behaviour is not yet well explained in the economic literature. In practice, however, we see more joint action than theory can explain. The candidate's publications address important issues regarding the formation and dynamics of cooperative groups, the role of trust, loyalty, members' satisfaction, and the importance of the leader. These are factors that are often ignored in economic research, but they are no less important than money and financial incentives.

The third area is related to economic development [(indicator 6): 1; (indicator 7): 3,5,8,13,15; (indicator 9): 2; (indicator 10): 1]. This line of work of the candidate is based mainly on the Neo-institutional economy. The approaches and conclusions of the research in the field of irrigation and the role of social capital for the formation of water associations are interesting. The initial author's hypothesis was that in places where there were water associations, it would be easier to create new ones. His studies have shown that there is no difference in the process in the two types of areas. The main conclusion that Assoc. Prof. Boevsky made in several of his works is that the reason for this is the level, formation and development of social capital. Building social capital takes time, and if interrupted, the process must start almost from the beginning. The works related to micro-financing, poverty, innovative business models in the food chains of small farms, included in this group, are also very interesting.

3. Citation by other authors.

There are 12 citations presented in the documents of one article. All citations are derived from reputable databases of scientific literature and are from different authors who have published in various journals. I personally checked Assoc. Prof. Boevsky in several scientific databases. He has more citations of other articles.

However, the presented citations are sufficient to meet the requirements for the academic position of "Professor".



4. Evaluation of the results of participation in research and creative projects and application of the obtained results in practice.

The candidate has indicated 17 projects on which he has worked. In four of which he was a project leader; two are international; and in 11 he was a participant. The subjects of the projects are related to the provided publications, which is an additional guarantee for the quality of the presented materials.

Regarding to this group of indicators, Assoc. Prof. Boevsky exceeds the necessary requirements. From the presented works, citations, participation in projects it can be concluded that the quality requirements of Law on the evaluation of the academic staff in the Republic of Bulgaria and of the New Bulgarian University for holding the academic position "Professor" - 3.8 Economics (business marketing and business management) are met.

### **III. Teaching and learning activities**

1. Classroom and extracurricular employment, work in the electronic training module "MOODLE - NBU", providing student internships and internships, work with students and PhD students.

The presented documents show a significant auditory and extra-auditory workload. In addition, the candidate teaches a significant number of different but complementary courses. In the system "Moodle NBU" are published materials for 20 courses, which he teaches at NBU.

For the period 2015-2020 he is the scientific supervisor of 29 students (bachelor's and master's) who successfully defended their theses. He has one doctoral student, successfully defended her dissertation. Assoc. Prof. Boevsky has participated in the development of master's programs in "Agribusiness Management and Rural Development" and "Business Communications".

2. Working with Erasmus students.

Assoc. Prof. Boevsky teaches three courses in English for students involved in ERASMUS + program: "International Marketing"; "Project management and communication techniques"; "Customer Relationship Management", as well as one course "Innovation Management", in a joint program between NBU and the University of Urbino "Carlo Bo". He has provided internships to 5 students from bachelor's programs at the Department of Economics, UniCredit Bulbank.

3. Grades from student surveys.

The presented report shows that the average grade from the surveys for satisfaction of students in the course for the last 5 years - 4.54 (maximum 5.00).

### **IV. Administrative and public activities**

1. Participation in collective governing bodies of NBU.

From the presented material it is evident that Assoc. Prof. Boevsky regularly and actively participates in the Department of Economics council meetings. In 2017 he was also a member of the Program Council of the Department. He also participates in various events for students and in the development of new courses (14) and in the improvement of programs (5) at NBU.

2. Social activity.

Since 2015, Assoc. Prof. Boevsky has been a member of the Management Board of the Institut für Genossenschaftswesen an der Humboldt Universität zu Berlin, Berlin, Deutschland. He was a member of the scientific jury for evaluation of projects of DAAD scholars and projects of the Bulgarian National Water Association. Reviewer and member of the editorial boards of the Yearbook "Economics and Business" of the Department of Economics. He has participated in the organization of 7 scientific conferences.



3. Attracting students to the program.

Assoc. Prof. Boevsky participated in the project "Advertising of NBU for the academic year 2019/2020 in the specialized language school" Exarch Joseph I "in Lovech. As a result of the project 10 students from this high school are enrolled in NBU for the academic year 2019/2020.

The presented materials for this section show that the requirements for public and administrative activity for holding the academic position "Professor" - 3.8 Economics (business marketing and business management) have been met.

**V. Personal impressions of the candidate (if any)**

My personal impressions of Assoc. Prof. Boevsky are from: 3 international projects we worked on together in the period 2000-2006; discussions on certain issues in various forums; from his publications. The reports on the three projects we worked on were presented to leading specialists in the given research areas (opponents). They were accepted after a positive evaluation by these specialists. In the publications of Assoc. Prof. Boevsky I see a lot of what was learned during this period.

The good theoretical training helps the candidate to combine different theories and make a connection between them. As I mentioned above, the monograph on cooperatives is a comprehensive study of the problem and it is one of the few works published over the past 20 years. At the beginning of this year, Assoc. Prof. Boevsky presented at a scientific conference an article on customer loyalty programs (this article is not included in the documentation). These programs are currently presented as business innovations. Assoc. Prof. Boevsky article argued that these practices have their roots in the cooperative movement and provoked an interesting discussion.

Assoc. Prof. Boevsky's work on projects and his consulting activities have given him the opportunity, along with theoretical training, to gain practical experience in solving a wide range of problems.

**VI. Opinions, recommendations and notes on the activity and achievements of the candidate**

I have no significant recommendations for the activities of Assoc. Prof. Boevsky, but I would recommend him to promote his monograph "Cooperative work in Bulgaria - Specific organizational design, marketing management, governance structure, and innovation." I would also recommend continuing his work in the field of institutional economics. The main challenges to the economic development of Bulgaria, in my opinion, are related to the level of transaction costs for doing business and the insufficient level of social capital.

**Conclusion**

The scientific production and the teaching activity of Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ivan Yochev Boevsky show that he meets all the requirements for holding the academic position of "Professor". Based on the above, I would recommend to the esteemed Academic Council, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ivan Yochev Boevsky to be elected "Professor" in the field of higher education 3." Social, economic and legal sciences ", professional field" 3.8. Economics (business marketing and business management)".

Date 02.09.2021.

Signature .....

Prof. Dr. Ivan Penov